



## NOTTINGHAMSHIRE AND CITY OF NOTTINGHAM FIRE AND RESCUE AUTHORITY

### MINUTES

of meeting of the Authority held on **16 DECEMBER 2011** at Fire and Rescue Service Headquarters, Bestwood Lodge, Nottingham from 10.30 am to 1.30 pm

#### Membership

Councillor D Pulk	(Chair)
Councillor B Grocock	(Vice-Chair)
Councillor C Arnold	
Councillor S Carroll	
Councillor B Cooper	
Councillor B Cross	
Councillor S Fielding	
Councillor K Girling	
Councillor J Hemsall	
Councillor E Kerry	
Councillor J Morris	
Councillor J Packer	
^ Councillor T Pettengell	
Councillor K Rigby	
Councillor D Smith	
Councillor T Spencer	
Councillor G Wheeler	
Councillor J Zadrozny	

Members absent are marked ^

#### **45 APOLOGY FOR ABSENCE**

An apology for absence was received from Councillor Pettengell.

#### **46 DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS**

No declarations of interests were made.

#### **47 MINUTES**

**RESOLVED that the non-exempt minutes of the meeting held on 16 September 2011, copies of which had been circulated, be confirmed and signed by the Chair.**

#### **48 CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Chair reported on the following matters:

- (1) the Chair had attended the full Nottingham City Council meeting on Monday 12 December, where former councillors were conferred with the title of Aldermen, in a special ceremony. The title was given to people in recognition of their eminent service as Councillors of the City Council. These included former City Councillor, Hylton James who had been a member of Nottinghamshire and City of Nottingham Fire Authority whilst serving as a City Councillor and his service on the Authority had been recognised when conferring the title;
- (2) the Chair had attended a combined meeting of Fire Authority Chairs and Chiefs at which a variety of matters had been discussed;
- (3) the Chair wished all Councillors and officers attending the meeting a Happy Christmas;
- (4) Councillor Fielding presented a petition to the meeting relating to the second appliance at Mansfield Fire Station. The Chair acknowledged the petition and advised the meeting that the petition would be presented to the Community Safety Committee to respond to.

#### **49 CHANGES TO COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIPS**

**RESOLVED that:**

- (1) **Councillor E Kerry be appointed to the Finance and Resources Committee and the Policy and Strategy Committee in place of Councillor T Pettengell;**
- (2) **Councillor T Pettengell be appointed to the Community Safety Committee in place of Councillor E Kerry.**

#### **50 ANNUAL AUDIT AND INSPECTION LETTER**

Consideration was given to a report of the Chief Fire Officer, copies of which had been circulated, presenting the external auditors' annual audit letter for the 2010/11 audit. Mr John Cornett, District Auditor, attended the meeting to present the report. Mr Cornett highlighted the following points from his report to the meeting:

- the requirement to deliver approximately £8 million savings over the next four years represented a significant financial challenge to the Authority. It was vital that there was resilience within the medium term financial strategy and that current governance arrangements were sufficiently robust to deliver the high level of scrutiny and engagement required in such a challenging financial climate;
- joint working arrangements would become increasingly important to financial resilience and continued success as the scale of anticipated savings could not be made in isolation;

- Mr Cornett's conclusion was that the Fire Authority had adequate arrangements in place to secure economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources;
- Mr Cornett thanked the officers who had been involved with the audit for their hard work and mature partnership approach throughout.

The Chair thanked the external auditors for their work and for the final report.

**RESOLVED that the contents of the report be noted.**

## **51 TREASURY MANAGEMENT MID-YEAR REVIEW 2011/12**

Consideration was given to a report of the Treasurer, copies of which had been circulated, providing an update on treasury management activity during the first half of the 2011/12 financial year. The Treasurer presented the report and advised the meeting that the current World economic situation meant that only low risk investments were being made by the Fire Authority on a short and prudent basis and that there had been no new borrowings. The review of compliance with treasury and prudential limits was set out in the report.

There had been a technical breach of the indicators in that the lower limit for loans maturing in 10 to 20 years was 20% and this indicator had been breached, with only 12% debt maturing in this period. The reason for the breach was that it was envisaged that a further loan would be taken in the 2010/11 financial year to fund the capital programme, and this would have been for a duration falling into the 10 to 20 year band, however a revenue contribution of £2.608 million was used to finance capital expenditure for 2010/11. This meant that the lower limit would continue to be breached until such time as a further loan was taken.

**RESOLVED that the contents of the report be noted.**

## **52 FIRE COVER REVIEW 2010- CONSULTATION OUTCOMES**

Consideration was given to the report of the Chief Fire Officer, copies of which had been circulated, providing members with information as to how the Fire Cover Review (FCR) 2010 public consultation had been implemented to satisfy the recommendation agreed at the meeting of the full Fire Authority on 24 June 2011 and to detail the outcomes of that process. The Chief Fire Officer (CFO) presented the report which included a full return from Opinion Research Services following the closure of public consultation.

Option 2 of the FCR had been highlighted as the CFO's preferred option and the Fire Authority had subsequently directed the CFO to arrange consultation on that Option. Opinion Research Services had been commissioned to formulate a consultation programme. Consultation had begun on 1 August 2011 for twelve weeks. This had been extended by three weeks and concluded on 13 November 2011.

Councillor Girling questioned the relatively low responses to the consultation and whether this was due to the consultation being too narrow or whether the presence on the ground had been too low. The Chair responded that robust methodology had been followed and section 2.2 of the report set out in detail the activities which had taken place within the public consultation exercise. The Authority had relied on the advice of Opinion Research Services who had put the process together to avoid legal challenge.

Councillor Zadrozny stated that he had grave concerns about the process, was unhappy with the poor level of responses and felt that the process did not represent good value for money, bearing in mind the cost of the consultation exercise against the number of responses received.

Councillor Morris emphasised the importance on not just relying on the outcome of the consultation process when making final decisions about the Fire Cover Review. There were other factors to be considered.

**RESOLVED that the outcomes of the consultation process with regard to option 2 of the Fire Cover Review be accepted.**

### **53 FIRE COVER REVIEW 2010 – NEXT STEPS**

Consideration was given to a report of the Chief Fire Officer, copies of which had been circulated, presenting the implications of Option 2 of the FCR following consultation.

The Chair proposed an amendment to the CFO's recommendations set out in the Report. This was seconded by the Vice-Chair, Councillor Grocock. The amendment read as follows:

'The proposed amendment accepts, endorses and supports the report of the Chief Fire Officer (CFO) 1.1 to 1.5.

The amendment is made taking into consideration the risk profile identified and independently verified within the Fire Cover Review as reported by the CFO

This amendment seeks to and will address the identified risk by enhancing cover in areas of under provision by providing additional resources to those areas and communities.

The amendment acknowledges the robust and thorough consultation process the Nottinghamshire and City of Nottingham Fire and Rescue Authority undertook during a fifteen week consultation period.

The consultation included twenty plus focus groups and briefing events held across the whole county involving businessmen and women, representatives of local groups, staff and members of the general public.

Questionnaires were widely distributed across the County including copies to all Nottinghamshire MPs, City, County and District Councillors.

The public were made aware of the opportunity to respond to the online questionnaire by the Service advertising the consultation through the local media. To enable as many responses as possible, a three week extension to the consultation period was agreed by the Nottinghamshire and City of Nottingham Fire and Rescue Authority.

The amendment recognises that in general the result of the consultation was broadly in support of the proposals put forward. However, there were concerns by some staff and public on some of the proposals. In particular, the only area of consultation which did not receive a majority of public support was the proposal relating to Mansfield.

Whilst recognising that the consultation is not a referendum, this amendment addresses the concerns expressed over proposals to Mansfield retained appliance and the decommissioning of the aerial ladder appliance located at Mansfield.

The amendment also seeks to address concerns expressed by Bassetlaw District Council and the workforce regarding the transfer of resource from Retford to Worksop. The amendment addresses the identified risk at Worksop by increasing resource at Worksop whilst maintaining the current fire cover at Retford.

The amendment also takes into account the concerns raised by the workforce regarding the Targeted Response Vehicles (TRV's). The amendment removes at this stage, the introduction of TRVs.

This amendment tasks the CFO to undertake a feasibility study into the effectiveness, performance and value for money of TRV's reporting back to members via the Community Safety Committee.

West Bridgford station will have a 24/7 whole time appliance supported by a 12/7 whole time appliance at times identified within the CFO's Fire Cover Review.

The amendment also gives consideration to the financial position of the Authority and acknowledges the savings the Service has made to date and takes into account the need to reduce the revenue budget in future years.

The table below identifies the Fire Cover Review as proposed in the amendment.

Worksop	1 whole time appliance 24/7 1 whole time appliance 12/7 1 retained appliance 12/7	Replace retained cover with whole time cover 12/7 (as proposed by option two of FCR)
Retford	1 whole time appliance 24/7 1 retained appliance 24/7	No change (amending the proposal within FCR option two to change the first appliance to 12/7)
Stockhill	X2 whole time appliances 24/7	No change
Mansfield	1 whole time appliance 24/7 1 retained appliance 24/7	No change (amending the proposal within FCR option two to remove from service the second appliance from Mansfield)
Mansfield ALP	ALP to be jump crewed	No change (amending the proposal of FCR option two to remove from service the ALP)
Edwinstowe	1 whole time appliance 24/7	1 whole time appliance 24/7 to replace 1 retained appliance 24/7 (as per the proposal within FCR option two)
Bingham	1 retained appliance 24/7 Supported by nucleus crewing	Upgraded 09.00-17.00 Monday to Friday by 4 extra whole time posts (as per

		recommendation within FCR option two)
Central	2 whole time appliances 24/7	No immediate change but Central fire station to be relocated to a city location towards the Trent Bridge area ASAP (as per recommendation within FCR option two)
West Bridgford	1 whole time appliance 24/7 1 whole time appliance 12/7	(Half) whole time appliance 12/7 to be removed (amending FCR option two to replace the second appliance with a TRV)
Arnold	1 whole time appliance 24/7	1 retained appliance 24/7 to be retained pending further Value for Money report on TRV concept (amending FCR option two to immediately replace the second appliance with a TRV)
Carlton	1 whole time appliance 24/7	1 retained appliance 24/7 to be removed (as per FCR option two)
Highfields	2 whole time appliances 24/7	1 retained appliance 24/7 to be removed (as per FCR option two)
Harworth	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Misterton	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Tuxford	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Blidworth	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Ashfield	1 whole time appliance 24/7 1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Warsop	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Southwell	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Collingham	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Stapleford	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Eastwood	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Hucknall	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
East Leake	1 retained appliance 24/7	No change
Newark	1 whole time appliance 24/7	No change

	1 retained appliance 24/7	
Special Rescue Team		No change
Targeted Response Vehicle	CFO to undertake a feasibility study into the effectiveness, performance and value for money of TRVs reporting back to members via the Community Safety Committee.	(amending recommendation of FCR option two to implement TRV's at two initial locations)

Summary/implications:

- increase the number of full time fire-fighters crewing appliances by 8 from 456 to 464;
- a potential reduction of retained fire-fighters by between 70/ 80 posts;
- vacancies and fire-fighter retirement profile at this time give opportunity for redeployment, subject to due process, of at-risk staff, minimising potential redundancies;
- need to address recruitment and retention issue at Mansfield;
- sickness pool to be absorbed into full time ridership – capacity to be created for additional pool financing
- some whole-time sickness to be covered by appliance sacrifice on degradation policy.

The recommendation in the report should be replaced with by:-

'Recommendations

- (1) it is recommended that the Fire Authority having given consideration to the results of the consultation implement Option 2 of the Fire Cover Review as modified by the table set out in this proposed amendment;
- (2) that the implementation of the review be actioned by the Chief Fire Officer.'

The meeting then voted on whether to accept the amendment to the recommendation and agreed to do so.

Councillor Wheeler proposed a further amendment:

'the proposed amendment by the Chair of the Nottinghamshire and City of Nottingham Fire and Rescue Authority pertaining to West Bridgford be amended:

- (1) in respect of the (half) whole-time appliance 12/7 to allow it to become a retained 12/7 unit during the evening/night hours;
- (2) during the day (12/7) this second tender be manned whole-time'

Councillor Wheeler asked that his thanks to the trade unions and the Chief Fire Officer and his team in respect of the hard work, effort and time they had expended in dealing with the matter be noted.

The amendment was seconded by Councillor Cooper.

Councillor Wheeler stated that the amendment was required to take into account the future impact on resources in West Bridgford of the widening of the A453, the building of a major supermarket on Wilford Lane, the extension of the tram network and the building of a significant number of new homes in the area.

The Chair requested an adjournment in order to consider the proposal. Councillor Wheeler objected to the adjournment but was approved by a majority of the members present.

The meeting adjourned at 12.57 pm and re-commenced at 1.15 pm.

The meeting voted on the amendment. When put to the vote the amended proposals were not carried.

Councillors requested that their votes be recorded. Those voting against the amendment: Councillors Pulk, Grocock, Arnold, Fielding, Carroll, Morris, Smith, Packer and Cross. Those voting in favour of the amendment; Councillors Rigby, Cooper, Hemsall, Kerry, Spencer, Wheeler, Girling and Zadrozny.

## **RESOLVED**

- (1) that the Fire Authority having given consideration to the results of the consultation, implement Option 2 of the Fire Cover Review as modified by the table set out above;**
- (2) that the implementation of the review be actioned by the Chief Fire Officer.**

## **54 UPDATED GOVERNANCE ARRANGEMENTS**

Consideration was given to a report of the Clerk to the Fire Authority, copies of which had been circulated, advising the meeting on the outcome of the review by the Standards Committee of revised Standing Orders, Terms of Reference, Complaints against Members Procedure and Financial Regulations and seeking approval to those documents.

The Clerk advised that the amendments to Standing Orders would be brought to a future meeting of the Fire Authority once issues raised by the Standards Committee had been clarified.



## **RESOLVED**

- (1) that following the review by the Standards Committee the Terms of Reference for the Committees, the Complaints against Members Procedure and revised Financial Regulations be approved;**
- (2) that further reports on the constitutional arrangements be presented to a future meeting of the full Fire Authority.**

### **55 COMMITTEE OUTCOMES FOR NOTING**

Consideration was given to reports of the Chairs of the following committees, copies of which, including minutes of those meetings, had been circulated:

- (a) Policy and Strategy Committee – 28 October 2011;
- (b) Performance Monitoring Committee – 30 September 2011
- (c) Finance and Resources Committee – 7 October 2011
- (d) Community Safety Committee – 14 October 2011
- (e) Human Resources Committee – 21 October 2011

**RESOLVED that the reports and the business undertaken by the Committees be noted.**

### **56 EXCLUSION OF PUBLIC**

**RESOLVED that, pursuant to section 100A (4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the remaining items on the basis that, having regard to all the circumstances, the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighed the public interest in disclosing the information, as defined in paragraphs 3 and 7B of Schedule 12A to the Local Government Act 1972 (as amended).**

### **57 NEW RISKS PROGRAMME**

Consideration was given to a report of the Chief Fire Officer, copies of which had been circulated, updating members on the new risks programme and informing them of the request for Nottinghamshire Fire and Rescue Service to engage with it.

**RESOLVED that Nottinghamshire Fire and Rescue Service's engagement in the new risks programme be endorsed.**

### **58 MINUTES**

**RESOLVED that the exempt minutes of the meeting held on 16 September 2011, copies of which had been circulated, be confirmed and signed by the Chair.**